



Volume 20, Number 1, 2021

ADVANCES IN MANAGEMENT

**A Publication of the Department of Business Administration;
University of Ilorin, Ilorin, Nigeria**

Advances In Management

**Journal of the
Department of Business Administration
University of Ilorin, Nigeria.**

**A Publication of
The Department of Business Administration
University of Ilorin, Ilorin,
Nigeria.**

ISSN: 0795-6967

VOLUME 20, NO.1 (2021)

Published by
The Department of Business Administration
University of Ilorin, Ilorin,
Nigeria.

All rights reserved: No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording or any information storage and retrieval system, without the prior permission in writing from the author or publisher.

Printed by:
UNILORIN PRESS
University of Ilorin, Ilorin, Nigeria
E-mail: unilorinpress@gmail.com

EDITORIAL TEAM

Editor-in-Chief

Prof. Jackson O. Olujide

University of Ilorin, Ilorin.

Deputy Editor-in-Chief

Prof. (Mrs.) S. L. Adeyemi

University of Ilorin, Ilorin.

ASSOCIATE EDITORS:

Prof. I.O. Taiwo

University of Ilorin, Ilorin.

Prof. P.H. Oribabor

Bowen University.

Prof. S. O. Oni

Fed. University of Tech. Minna.

Dr. A. Adeleye

Redeemers University.

Dr. R.A. Olowe

University of Lagos, Lagos.

Prof. M.L. Nassara

Obafemi Awolowo University, Ile-Ife.

Prof. K.S. Adeyemi

Covenant University, Ota Ogun State.

Prof. D. Irifin

Federal University, Lokoja.

Dr. G.K. Olorunleke

Adekunle Ajasin University, Ota, Ogun State.

Business Manager:

Dr. I. I. Aun

University of Ilorin, Ilorin.

CONTENTS

BUSINESS ETHICS AND ORGANISATIONAL PERFORMANCE Abdul Falilat Ajoke	1
CUSTOMER RELATIONSHIP MARKETING MANAGEMENT (CRM) AND CUSTOMERS RETENTION AMONG SMALL BUSINESSES IN BENIN-CITY, EDO STATE Angela Obose ORIAZOWANLAN	13
CORONAVIRUS (COVID-19) PANDEMIC AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF SMALL AND MEDIUM SCALE ENTERPRISES IN SELECTED LOCAL GOVERNMENT AREAS OF LAGOS STATE Bashiru Akande Bello, Patrick Ologbenla, Ozinegbe Victor Igbinovia	28
EMPLOYEES OUTSOURCING IN THE NIGERIAN MANUFACTURING SECTOR: RESOURCE BASED VIEW (RBV) PERSPECTIVE Ekanem Daniel EKANEM, Gabriel Tuoyo KUBEYINJE	40
ADOPTING GROWTH STRATEGY AND ORGANISATIONAL PERFORMANCE Jatto, Abdulmajeed Adewale, Bello, Kamal Asola, Najeem, Monsuru Oladipupo, Zubair, Oluwatosin Sidiquat	56
QUALITATIVE STUDY ON CONTEMPORARY UNIVERSITY MANAGEMENT AND THE CHANGING NATURE OF ACADEMIC LABOUR IN UNIVERSITIES Nekpen Euodia OKHAWERE	71
ENTERPRISE RESOURCE PLANNING AND GROWTH OF MANUFACTURING FIRMS IN ADO-ODO OTA LOCAL GOVERNMENT AREA OF OGUN STATE IFEKWEM, Nkiruka, E.	82
SERVICE QUALITY AND CUSTOMER SATISFACTION: AN ANALYSIS OF WATER SUPPLY IN LAGOS Simeon E. Ifere, Chinenye A. Onyemaobi	97
SUSTAINING SUPPLIERS' COMPETITIVE ADVANTAGE IN PRIVATE SCHOOLS' BOOKSHOPS: THE ROLE OF CUSTOMER VALUE CREATION AND ADAPTIVE CAPABILITY Christopher I. Ebegbetale, Simeon E. Ifere	119

**CONCEPT OF COST AND ASSETS RETRENCHMENT ON PERFORMANCE
OF TEXTILE INDUSTRY**

NASIRU, Liman Zuru; GADO, Bature

140

**SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT PRACTICES AND CUSTOMER
SATISFACTION IN THE MANUFACTURING FIRMS IN NIGERIA**

OMIGIE, Obehi Samuel; KUBEYINJE, Gabriel Tuoyo

150

**SCANNING OF ENTERPRISE DIVERSITY AND EMPLOYEES MANAGEMENT
OF CHINESE QUARRY COMPANIES IN SUB-METROPOLITAN, NIGERIA**
**Akinbola, Olufemi Amos, Abiodun Abolaji Joachim, Kowo Solomon Akpoviroro,
Oyedele, Ola Olusegun**

166

**ORGANISATIONAL CONFLICT AND EMPLOYEES PRODUCTIVITY:
STUDY OF SELECTED MANUFACTURING COMPANY IN KWARA STATE**

Yusuf I., A. Salman, Olawale, Y.A.

184

**AN EXPLORATORY ANALYSIS OF CUSTOMER RELATIONSHIP MANAGEMENT
ON END-USERS' EXPERIENCE IN GLOBACOM NIGERIA LIMITED**

Yusuf Ismail

198

AN EXPLORATORY ANALYSIS OF CUSTOMER RELATIONSHIP MANAGEMENT ON END-USERS' EXPERIENCE IN GLOBACOM NIGERIA LIMITED

Yusuf Ismail

Affiliation: Kwara State University Malete,
Department of Business and Entrepreneurship
E-mail: yusufismael@yahoo.com

Abstract

This research explores the relationship between customer relationship management on end-users' experience with a particular reference to globacom Nigeria limited, Ilorin West Local Government Area, kwara State. It is aimed at finding out the extent to which a good customer relationship management helps in having a positive end-user' experience in globacom Nigeria limited, Ilorin West Local Government Area, kwara State. In an attempt to establish the thrust of this research, primary data was generated through self-administered questionnaire. Both descriptive and inferential statistics were utilized for data analysis with the aid of statistics package for social sciences (SPSS). Descriptive data were analyzed using simple percentage table and regression analytical tools were used to test the hypothesis. Primary data were obtained through a cross sectional survey, using a well-structured, self-administered questionnaire to 348 subscribers of globacom subscribers in Ilorin West Local Government Area, Kwara State, Nigeria. The data were analyzed using descriptive and inferential statistics. Findings revealed that a positive and highly significant (0.05) relationship exist between sustainable service innovation and customer commitment and competitive service innovation and product performance.

Keywords: Customer relationship management, End-user's experience, telecommunication Industry.

Introduction

In today's turbulent business environment, firms that build a good customer relationship stands a better chance of gaining the highest competitive advantage over those that fails to appreciate the essence of customers. Therefore, an important tool in building and sustaining competitive advantage through the implementation of customer relationship management practices is superior customer value. Customer relationship management is the principles, practices and guidelines that an organization follows when interacting with its customers. CRM is a practice used by an organization to attract and retain customers and this has become one of the most considerable factors in the success of both manufacturing businesses and service providers. Hence, CRM has become an important factor for many organizations now as a shift from customer acquisition towards building

customer relationships. Swift, (2001) argues that a lot of benefits can be drawn from CRM initiatives in higher customer retention and loyalty. Thus, leading to higher profitability, growth in market share and greater competitive advantage. The customer relationship management process does not just end when a customer is won. Rather it should continue throughout the time that the customer will last in the organization. Mobile telecommunication is one of the fastest growing industries in Nigeria today as the industry is characterized by various players which include: MTN, Airtel, 9mobile and Globacom respectively. The industry has grown up to be highly competitive as different communication firms push for the attention of subscribers. The major problem facing the industry is basically on how to manage the quality of the service been provided to their various subscribers as this service quality holds a great deal to customer satisfaction. Customer satisfaction and service quality are the key elements in maintaining customer loyalty, customer commitment, sustainable service and above all competitive advantage. Although, competition is inescapable in the telecommunication industry in Nigeria, the mobile telecommunication firms are continually improving upon the quality of their service delivery, with the influence of the Nigerian Communications Commission (NCC). It is against this backdrop that, this study seeks to assess the relevance of customer relationship management on end-users' experience in Nigeria telecommunication industry.

Research questions

This research work aims at providing answers to the following questions which are:

- i. How has sustainable service innovation affected customer commitment?
- ii. To what extent does competitive service innovation affect product performance?

Objectives of the study

The general objective of this research is to assess the relevance of customer relationship management on end-users' experience in Nigeria telecommunication industry. Specific objectives are to:

- i. examine the effect of sustainable services innovation on customer commitment;

- ii. assess the effect of competitive service innovation on product performance.

Research hypotheses

Ho1 Sustainable services innovation has no significant relationship on customer commitment.

Ho2 There is no significant relationship between competitive service innovation and product performance.

Literature review

Customer relationship management

According to Pickton and Broderick (2005), CRM is a view that emphasizes the importance of the relationships developed between an organization and its customers. It involves the strategic and tactical management tasks to achieve positive communications and long-term customer relationships. Berkowitz (2006) also defines customer relationship management (CRM) as "the organization's attempt to develop a long-term, cost-effective link with the customer for the benefit of both the customer and the organization." According to Anderson (2000), the three sectors of business that rely most heavily on CRM and use it to great advantage are:

- Financial services sector
- A variety of high-tech corporations and
- Telecommunications industry.

Peel (2002) defines CRM as understanding the nature of the exchange between customer and supplier and managing it appropriately. This refers to the exchange of value between supplier and customer. The priority of the exchanging parties is to optimize their benefits thus, ensuring a profitable long-term relationship.

Customer Relationship Management (CRM) is a concept to enhance a company's ability to retain customers and gain strategic advantage over its competitors. It is focused on creating and managing relationships with customers more effectively through detailed and accurate analysis of consumer data using various information technologies (Gosney & Boehm 2000). Customer relationship management helps to achieve organizational

goal as well as improve the experience that customers get from the organization.

CRM is basically about identifying and understanding customer needs, influencing customer behaviour, satisfying and retaining them through an ongoing communication.

This concept is proxied by: Sustainable service innovation which is all about creating and integrating new business strategies, products, and services that accelerate positive social change and protect and preserve environmental integrity and Competitive Service Innovation which is a process whereby an organization develops a certain modern attribute/features that has not been used by any organization before which allow them to outperform their business counterparts.

End-users' experience

End-users' experience of a service may depend on several factors. Garrett (2002) considered the concept of user experience to be associated with all possible user actions for a particular web site. Neslin, Scott, Dhruv, Robert, Venkatesh, Marije, Jacquelyn and Peter (2006), discussed web site usability and trust as particularly important for end-users' experience. Petersen, Leigh, David, Russell, Kumar and Geoff (2009) extended the concept of user experience beyond mere interaction with a website to also include delivery of products, support, and consumption of products and services. The investigation of end-users experience has been conducted in a variety of manners. In order to gain in-depth insight into the subjective experiences of a small number of people, methods like interviews and focus groups has been used for decades.

The user experience associated with products and services has been made subject of great attention within the field of HCI the last decade or so. Focusing on the end-users' experience is regarded as a consequence of that electronic services to a greater degree are developed to be desirable and cause emotional responses in the users, rather than just provide the end-users with assistance to solve a given set of task. According to Hassenzahl and Tractinsky (2006), research on the user experience of products and services is related to subjective emotion and affect, situated experiences, and holistic and aesthetic qualities associated with the interaction between a system and its users.

This concept on the hand proxied by: Customer Commitment which is described as Customer's engagement or continuous obligation to buy the same product or use the same company or customer's desire to maintain a relationship with the a particular company and product performance which means an aspect of market performance that denotes the quality and performance of existing products and firms' records with respect to the development of new products. The introduction of new products and the qualitative improvement of existing products may enhance consumer welfare by providing consumers with 'better-value-for-money' in terms of price/quality trade-offs.

Theoretical review

Assimilation-contrast theory

This study is underpinned by the Assimilation-Contrast theory and supported by the theories of cognitive dissonance and American Customer Satisfaction Index (ACSI) theory. The suitability of the underpinning theory is anchored on the fact that the theory explained the concept of End-user's experience vividly by explaining the experience that occurs as a result of comparing services performance against expectations.

Empirical review

Adamu, (2021), examined the Effect of customer relationship management on organizational performance of Airtel Nigeria in Adamawa State, Nigeria. The researcher used both primary and secondary sources from a sample of 139 respondents obtained by the use of a structured questionnaire. The data collected were analyzed using descriptive statistics such as frequency, simple percentage, and the relationship between the variables of the model was tested using multiple regression analysis. The result of the regression analysis shows that a positive relationship exists between Information Sharing, Knowledge Management, and Technology based customer relationship management with Organizational Performance of Airtel Adamawa State and the relationship is statistically significant ($p < 0.05$) and in line with a priori expectation. This implies that a unit increase in these explanatory variables will result in a corresponding increase in organizational performance of Airtel in Adamawa State by 52.4%, 62.3 %, and 42.2 % respectively. A negative relationship exists between Marketing Implementation and Organizational Performance of Airtel Adamawa State in Adamawa State and the relationship is statistically significant and the relationship is not in line with a priori

expectation. It was concluded that customer relationship management has been identified as an important strategy for achieving the benefits of cost reductions, customer satisfaction, customer retention, and sales growth and profitability which are indices of organizational performance. It was recommended among others that since marketing implementation had a negative effect on organizational performance of Airtel in Adamawa State, management of Airtel can reduce this by implementing strategic decision which creates specific actions that will ensure that the marketing objectives are achieved and improve organizational performance in the telecommunication sector in the study area.

Anyionu and Opara (2021), conducted a research titled Customer Loyalty Determinants in Nigerian Telecommunication Industry. The main objective of the study was to determine the effects of complaint handling on customer loyalty. The study was a survey research design. The questionnaire was structured using five point likert scale. The population of the study was 173 subscribers from the different service providers in the south East. The hypotheses was tested using simple regression analysis which was facilitated by statistical package for social sciences (SPSS) version 20. The reliability of the scale was accessed by the use of Cronbach's Alpha which yielded 0.86. The findings of the study revealed that complaint handling has significant and positive relationship on customer loyalty. This means that Subscribers will stay with their service providers as long as their complaints are promptly attended to. That failure to attend to their complaints can lead to switching which has adverse effect on the firms' performance. The study recommended that the network providers should develop some complaint handling techniques that will attract and hold subscribers for a long time. Such techniques include offering high quality services, prompt attention to service failures, providing affordable services, and providing customer satisfaction that will improve the firm's services. The provision of such techniques will help those who have been assessing their customer care units to have solution to their complaints whenever such complaints arise.

Methodology

This study examines the relevance of customer relationship management on end-users' experience in Nigeria telecommunication industry. It is a survey research method, and therefore adopted the use of questionnaires in eliciting information from the respondents. The sample size for this study was 384 Globacom customers in Ilorin West Local Government, Kwara State, Nigeria. The study employs the use of questionnaires as instrument for data

collection. The items were measured on a 5 – point likert scale ranging from strongly agree (5) to strongly disagree (1). Primary data were used. Primary data was obtained with the aids of questionnaire. The use of questionnaire was employed to gather relevant information from the respondents. Data was analyzed using inferential and descriptive statistics. The descriptive statistics involves frequency tables and percentages while the inferential statistics involves regression, analysis of variance (ANOVA) and linear regression analysis.

Table, 1 Questionnaire distribution and return rate

	No. Distributed	No. Returned	% Returned	No. Not Returned	% Not Returned
Respondents	384	348	90.63%	36	9.37%
TOTAL	384	348	90.63%	36	9.37%

As shown in Table 1, questionnaire distribution demonstrates an approximately 90.63% response rate. The researcher was able to gather 348 out of the 384 questionnaires distributed to the various Globacom customer in the study area (Ilorin West Local Government, Kwara State).

Data analysis

Analysis demographic questions

In order to achieve the main purpose of this study, the researcher found it useful to find out the general information of the respondents. The general information of the respondents included gender, age, marital status, and educational qualifications of the respondents.

collection. The items were measured on a 5 – point likert scale ranging from strongly agree (5) to strongly disagree (1). Primary data were used. Primary data was obtained with the aids of questionnaire. The use of questionnaire was employed to gather relevant information from the respondents. Data was analyzed using inferential and descriptive statistics. The descriptive statistics involves frequency tables and percentages while the inferential statistics involves regression, analysis of variance (ANOVA) and linear regression analysis.

Table, 1 Questionnaire distribution and return rate

	No. Distributed	No. Returned	% Returned	No. Not Returned	% Not Returned
Respondents	384	348	90.63%	36	9.37%
TOTAL	384	348	90.63%	36	9.37%

As shown in Table 1, questionnaire distribution demonstrates an approximately 90.63% response rate. The researcher was able to gather 348 out of the 384 questionnaires distributed to the various Globacom customer in the study area (Ilorin West Local Government, Kwara State).

Data analysis

Analysis demographic questions

In order to achieve the main purpose of this study, the researcher found it useful to find out the general information of the respondents. The general information of the respondents included gender, age, marital status, and educational qualifications of the respondents.

Table 2: Demographic characteristics of respondents

S/N	Variable	Levels	Frequency	Percentage
1	Gender	Male	159	45.69
		Female	189	54.31
2	Age	Below 20	20	5.75
		21-30	49	14.08
		31-40	165	47.41
		41-50	59	16.95
		Above 50	55	15.81
3	Marital status	Single	158	45.40
		Married	169	48.56
		Others	21	6.04
4	Educational Qualification of the Respondents	SSCE	23	6.61
		NCE/ND	59	16.95
		HND/Bsc.	178	51.15
		Postgraduate	88	25.29

Source: SPSS Extracted Computations

Table 2 shows personal information of the respondents across the gender, age, marital status and educational background of the respondents. First, respondents were classified on the basis of gender given the fact that gender could have influence on customer loyalty. The analysis indicates that 159(45.69%) of the respondents were males while 189(54.31%) of them were females. This suggests that both gender groups are fairly represented in the study.

Furthermore, they were classified on the basis of their age distribution. Here, analysis revealed that 20(5.75%) of them were within the age below 20 years, 49(14.08%) of them were within the age bracket of 21-30 years of ages, 165(47.41%) of them were within the age bracket of 31-40 year, 59(16.95%) of them were within the age bracket of 41-50 years of ages while 55(15.81%) of them were within the age bracket above 50 years.

They were further classified on the basis of their marital status. 158(45.40%) of the respondents were single, 169(48.56%) of them were married while 21(6.04%) of them fell in other category.

Similarly, 23(6.61%) of them had SSCE educational qualifications, 59(16.95%) of them had NCE/ND qualifications, 178(51.15%) of them had HND/Bsc qualifications while 88(25.29%) of them had postgraduate qualifications.

Table 2: Demographic characteristics of respondents

S/N	Variable	Levels	Frequency	Percentage
1	Gender	Male	159	45.69
		Female	189	54.31
2	Age	Below 20	20	5.75
		21-30	49	14.08
		31-40	165	47.41
		41-50	59	16.95
		Above 50	55	15.81
3	Marital status	Single	158	45.40
		Married	169	48.56
		Others	21	6.04
4	Educational Qualification of the Respondents	SSCE	23	6.61
		NCE/ND	59	16.95
		HND/Bsc.	178	51.15
		Postgraduate	88	25.29

Source: SPSS Extracted Computations

Table 2 shows personal information of the respondents across the gender, age, marital status and educational background of the respondents. First, respondents were classified on the basis of gender given the fact that gender could have influence on customer loyalty. The analysis indicates that 159(45.69%) of the respondents were males while 189(54.31%) of them were females. This suggests that both gender groups are fairly represented in the study.

Furthermore, they were classified on the basis of their age distribution. Here, analysis revealed that 20(5.75%) of them were within the age below 20 years, 49(14.08%) of them were within the age bracket of 21-30 years of ages, 165(47.41%) of them were within the age bracket of 31-40 year, 59(16.95%) of them were within the age bracket of 41-50 years of ages while 55(15.81%) of them were within the age bracket above 50 years.

They were further classified on the basis of their marital status. 158(45.40%) of the respondents were single, 169(48.56%) of them were married while 21(6.04%) of them fell in other category.

Similarly, 23(6.61%) of them had SSCE educational qualifications, 59(16.95%) of them had NCE/ND qualifications, 178(51.15%) of them had HND/Bsc qualifications while 88(25.29%) of them had postgraduate qualifications.

Descriptive statistics of variables**Analysis of research question one**

How has Sustainable Service Innovation affected Customer Commitment?

Table 3: Sustainable service innovation

SN	Response	$\bar{X}$	SD	Rank	Remarks
1	Sustainable innovation is the use of open innovation in the development of sustainable product services and imitative	3.46	0.59	5 th	A
2	Sustainable service innovation promotes the use of sustainable product and service	3.37	0.55	4 th	A
3	Sustainable service innovation in the telecommunication industry provides innovative service solution	3.58	0.53	3 rd	SA
4	Innovative service solution provider assists company in providing sustainable service innovation	3.40	0.49	1 st	A
5	Service system upgrading guarantee sustainable service innovation	3.43	0.51	2 nd	A
Cluster Summary		3.45	0.56		A

Key: $\bar{X}$ = Mean, SD = Standard Deviation, SA = Strongly Agreed (3.50-3.99); A = Agreed (2.50-3.49); SD = Strongly disagree (1.50-2.49); D = Disagree (0.50-1.49); N = Neutral (≤ 0.49) and n = number of respondents (348).

From the data presented in above table, it was revealed that the mean ratings of the responses of the respondents on item 3 which fell within the boundary limit of 3.50 – 3.99 on a 5-point rating scale. This indicated that the identified item was “Strongly Agreed” by the respondents on sustainable service innovation. The mean values of the remaining 4 items, specifically items 1, 2, 4 and 5 were 3.46, 3.37, 3.40 and 3.43 respectively which are within the boundary limit of 3.00 – 3.49 on 5-point rating scale. This indicated that the remaining 4 items are “Agreed” by the respondents to be their perceptions on sustainable service innovation.

The cluster mean value of 3.45 which fell within boundary limit of 3.0 – 3.49 infers that the respondents agreed that the identified 5 items are levels of sustainable service innovation. The standard deviation values of the 5 identified levels in the table ranged from 0.49 to 0.59 which indicated that the responses of the respondents are close to one another and the mean.

Table 4: Customer commitment

SN	Response	$\bar{X}$	SD	Rank	Remark
1	A satisfied customer will show commitment to the product or services	3.46	0.59	5 th	A
2	Customer commitments enhance repeat purchase of services in telecommunication industry	3.37	0.55	4 th	A
3	Innovative customer service is essential to the purchase	3.58	0.53	3 rd	SA
4	Customer loyalty is a buyer's overall attachment or a deep commitment to a product or service brand	3.40	0.49	1 st	A
5	Customer loyalty guarantees repeat patronage and reduce customer turnover	3.47	0.51	2 nd	A
Cluster Summary		3.46	0.53		A

Key: $\bar{X}$ = Mean, SD = Standard Deviation, SA = Strongly Agreed (3.50-3.99); A = Agreed (2.50-3.49); SD = Strongly disagree (1.50-2.49); D = Disagree (0.50-1.49); N = Neutral (≤ 0.49) and n = number of respondents (348).

From the data presented in table 4, it was revealed that the mean ratings of the responses of the respondents on item 3 which fell within the boundary limit of 3.50 – 3.99 on a 5-point rating scale. This indicated that the identified item was “Strongly Agreed” by the respondents on customer commitment. The mean values of the remaining 4 items, specifically items 1, 2, 4 and 5 were 3.46, 3.37, 3.40 and 3.47 respectively which are within the boundary limit of 3.00 – 3.49 on 5-point rating scale. This indicated that the remaining 4 items are “Agreed” by the respondents to be their perceptions on customer commitment.

The cluster mean value of 3.46 which fell within boundary limit of 3.0 – 3.49 infers that the respondents agreed that the identified 5 items are levels of customer commitment. The standard deviation values of the 5 identified levels in the table ranged from 0.49 to 0.59 which indicated that the responses of the respondents are close to one another and the mean.

Table 5: Competitive service innovation

SN	Competitive Service Innovation	$\bar{X}$	SD	Rank	Remark
1	Competitive service can be gained when an organization produce its good or service more cheaply	3.53	0.59	5 th	SA
2	Competitive service innovation is attainable by providing high quality product and services to most customer desire	3.52	0.55	4 th	SA
3	Competitive service innovation enhances good product performance	3.55	0.53	3 rd	SA
4	Competitive service innovation enhances customer satisfaction	3.44	0.49	1 st	A
5	To attain the competitive advantage, telecommunication industry needs to introduce more innovative services	3.49	0.51	2 nd	A
Cluster Summary		3.51	0.53		A

Key: $\bar{X}$ = Mean, SD = Standard Deviation, SA = Strongly Agreed (3.50-3.99); A = Agreed (2.50-

3.49); SD = Strongly disagree (1.50- 2.49); D = Disagree (0.50-1.49); N=Neutral (≤ 0.49) and n = number of respondents (345).

From the data presented in table 5, it was revealed that the mean ratings of the responses of the respondents on items 1, 2 and 3 which fell within the boundary limit of 3.50 – 3.99 on a 5-point rating scale. This indicated that the identified item was “Strongly Agreed” by the respondents on competitive service innovation. The mean values of the remaining 2 items, specifically items 4 and 5 were 3.44 and 3.49 respectively which are within the boundary limit of 3.00 – 3.49 on 5-point rating scale. This indicated that the remaining 2 items are “Agreed” by the respondents to be their perceptions on competitive service innovation.

The cluster mean value of 3.51 which fell within boundary limit of 3.5 – 3.99 infers that the respondents strongly agreed that the identified 5 items are levels of customer commitment. The standard deviation values of the 5 identified levels in the table ranged from 0.49 to 0.59 which indicated that the responses of the respondents are close to one another and the mean.

Table 6: Product performance

SN	Product performance	$\bar{X}$	SD	Rank	Remarks
1	Product performance enhances customer loyalty and commitment	3.53	0.59	5 th	SA
2	Service quality guarantee customer satisfaction	3.58	0.55	4 th	SA
3	Effective product performance assists organization in providing services more cheaply	3.56	0.53	3 rd	SA
4	Innovative customer service enhance product performance	3.43	0.49	2 nd	A
5	Customer interaction improves service innovation	3.45	0.47	1 st	A
	Cluster Summary	3.51	0.53		A

Key: $\bar{X}$ = Mean, SD = Standard Deviation, SA = Strongly Agreed (3.50-3.99); A = Agreed (2.50-3.49); SD = Strongly disagree (1.50-2.49); D = Disagree (0.50-1.49); N = Neutral (≤ 0.49) and n = number of respondents (348).

From the data presented in table 6, it was revealed that the mean ratings of the responses of the respondents on item 1, 2 and 3 which fell within the boundary limit of 3.50 – 3.99 on a 5-point rating scale. This indicated that the identified items were “Strongly Agreed” by the respondents on product performance. The mean values of the remaining 2 items, specifically items 4 and 5 were 3.43 and 3.45 respectively which are within the boundary limit of 3.00 – 3.49 on 5-point rating scale. This indicated that the remaining 2 items are “Agreed” by the respondents to be their perceptions on product performance.

The cluster mean value of 3.46 which fell within boundary limit of 3.0 – 3.49 infers that the respondents agreed that the identified 5 items are levels of product performance. The standard deviation values of the 5 identified levels in the table ranged from 0.47 to 0.59 which indicated that the responses of the respondents are close to one another and the mean.

Test of hypotheses

General Model:

$$Y = \beta_0 + \beta_1 X_1 + \beta_2 X_2 + \beta_3 X_3 + \dots + \beta_n X_n$$

Where

Y = the dependent variable

β_0 = slope

$\beta_1, \beta_2, \dots, \beta_n$ are the coefficients for the variables $X_1, X_2, \dots, X_n$ respectively

Hypothesis One

H₀₁: Sustainable service innovation has no significant relationship on customer commitment.

Table 7 Model Summary

Model	R	R-Square	Adjusted R-Square	Std. error of the estimate
1	0.793	0.512	0.401	6.8741

a. Dependent variable: customer commitment

b. Predictor: (constant), sustainable service innovation

Table 8 ANOVA

Model		Sum of square	DF	Means Square	F	Sig.
1	Regression	7095.088	1	7095.088	280.261	0.000
	Residual	8784.782	347	25.316		
	Total	15879.870	348			

a. Dependent variable: customer commitment

b. Predictor: (constant), sustainable service innovation

Table 9 Regression Coefficient

Model 1	Unstandardized β	Standardized coefficient Beta	T	Sig.
Constant	9.235	0.987	11.278	0.000
Sustainable service innovation	0.798	0.472	14.892	0.000

a. Dependent variable: customer commitment

b. Predictor: (constant), sustainable service innovation

In tables 7 above, the result of the linear regression of the independent variable, sustainable service innovation and the dependent variable, customer commitment is presented. According to the tables, sustainable service innovation has a significant and positive impact on customer commitment at the 0.05 significant level with the T statistics at 14.892, $p = 0.000$ ($p < 0.05$). Hence a rejection of the null hypothesis which predicted a non-significant relationship between these two variables. In addition, since the model shows a standardized beta value of 0.672, this is an indication that every unit or 100% change in sustainable service innovation will lead to a corresponding change of 0.672 or about 67.2% change in customer

commitment. It therefore means that if the telecom industry cited as the case of study focuses on improvement of sustainable service innovation, such action might likely make subscribers (customers) to be committed in patronizing the service of the telecommunication industry.

Furthermore, as shown in the table, the R square value for the model is 0.512. This means that the predictor variable, sustainable service innovation predicts about 0.512 of the variance in customer commitment. Thus, about 51.2% of the variability in sustainable service innovation by the management of the telecom industry is accounted for by the variability in the combination of customer commitment. Also, the one way ANOVA in table 9 shows an observed large value of "F" ratio, a significant value of 0.000 and less than 0.05 indicating a strong and significant relationship between the independent variable (sustainable service innovation) on one side and the dependent variable (customer commitment) on the other side. By this, if the organization increases on improving on its service through sustainable service innovation (i.e nothing good that does not require improvement), commitment of the customers to such service rendered would be intact.

Hypothesis two

H₀₂: There is significant relationship between competitive service innovation and product performance.

Table 10

Model Summary

Model	R	R-Square	Adjusted R-Square	Std. error of the estimate
1	0.865	0.642	0.439	7.0812

a. Dependent variable: Product performance

b. Predictor: (constant), competitive service innovation

Table 11

ANOVA

Model		Sum of square	DF	Means Square	F	Sig
1	Regression	6998.674	1	6998.674	273.449	0.000
	Residual	8881.196	347	25.594		
	Total	15879.870	348			

a. Dependent variable: Product performance

c. Predictor: (constant), competitive service innovation

Table 12

Regression Coefficient

Model 1	Unstandardized β	Coefficient Std Error	Standardized coefficient Beta	T	Sig
Constant	10.134	0.949		12.341	0.000
Competitive service innovation	0.891	0.512	0.71	15.763	0.000

a. Dependent variable: Product performance

b. Predictor: (constant), competitive service innovation

The result of the linear regression of the independent variable, competitive service innovation and the dependent variable, product performance is presented. According to the tables 12, competitive service innovation has a significant and positive impact on product performance at the 0.05 significant level with the T statistics at 15.763, $p = 0.000$ ($p < 0.05$). Hence, a rejection of the null hypothesis which predicted a non-significant relationship between these two variables. In addition, since the model shows a standardized beta value of 0.71, this is an indication that every unit or 100% change in competitive service innovation will lead to a corresponding change of 0.71 or about 71% change in product performance. It therefore means that if telecom companies focus on improvement of competitive service innovation, such action might likely contribute to experiencing an improved product performance.

Furthermore, as shown in table 10, the R square value for the model is 0.642. This means that the predictor variable, sustainable service innovation predicts about 0.642 of the variance in customer commitment. Thus, about 64.2% of the variability in competitive service innovation by the management of the telecom industry is accounted for by the variability in an improved product patronage. Also, the one-way ANOVA in table 11 shows an observed large value of "F" ratio, a significant value of 0.000 and less than 0.05 indicating a strong and significant relationship between the independent variable (competitive service innovation) on one side and the dependent variable (product performance) on the other side.

Discussion of findings

The main objective of this study was to determine the relevance of customer relationship management on end-users' experience in Nigeria telecommunication industry. On the basis of this objective, two null hypotheses which proposed that there is no significant relationship between significant Sustainable service innovation and customer commitment and

there is no significant relationship between competitive service innovation and product performance were put forward. However, these hypotheses were rejected based on the findings that a positive and highly significant (0.05) relationship exist between sustainable service innovation and customer commitment and competitive service innovation and product performance. In other words, it was uncovered that Sustainable service innovation has significant impact on customer commitment and that competitive service innovation has significant impact on product performance.

In general, the present era customer relationship of telecommunication industry in Nigeria and customer satisfaction is the prime model modification in achieving sustainable service innovation in improving business performance in the present eras towards retaining such customers. Experiences of Nigeria telecommunication end users can be affiliated to their perceptions on service delivery and satisfaction with such service rendered. Findings from this study revealed that satisfaction of telecommunication end users covers the overall evaluation of their experiences, excitements and reactions with the company on temporary basis or specific encounter.

Supportive service innovation of the telecommunication industry enhances an improved customer satisfaction of the telecommunication service. A finding from this study reveals that to support inducement of customer commitment towards telecommunication service patronage, there is need for an improved sustainable service innovation. The result contained in table 7 supports this where the relationship existing between sustainable service innovation and supportive service is found significant with test statistics $t=14.892$ and $p\text{-value} (0.000)$ less than 0.05. This finding is supported by Ndubisi (2004) that firms might achieve consumer commitment by increasing on supportive service innovation that can trigger spirits of loyalty among customers and room for captivating fresh customers. In context of telecommunication service provision, when a consumer is dedicated and frequently uses service, henceforth, there is an improved level of belief and move toward consumer faithfulness, thereby contributing towards achieving developed overall firm effectiveness and aids the organization for the establishment of new products as source of novel ideas.

Result contained in table 12 shows that product performance of the telecommunication in industry in Nigeria is dependent of competitive service innovation with test statistics $t=15.763$ with $p\text{-value} (0.000)$ less than 0.05, clearly indicating that competitive service innovation is a solution and value creation in telecommunication industry. Therefore, contributing in bridging

the existing gaps in a competitive market world advantage, as innovation is the beginning of an idea that reaches its excellence through continuous results and determines the long-term success and value-creation of business organizations. In today's competitive environment, product performance is dependent of the service innovation which is the key to an organization's success and survival. An intense competitive service innovation highlights the increasing product performance towards improving the worthiness of a business organization.

Overall, findings in this study reveal the paramount importance of customer expectation in relation to the perceived performance of telecommunication services. It indicates that mobile telecom company can stimulate repurchase intention from subscribers and increase their commitment by making provision for those products/services that aggregate or surpasses expectation. Furthermore, it was equally discovered that the mean score among subscribers in the constructs of customer satisfaction and customer loyalty are well above average. Hence, this is an indication that the mobile telecom service providers in the environment in focus are doing a great job in delivering quality products/services to these subscribers on consistent basis and this has hitherto resulted in a high switching cost for them and their willingness to remain as loyal customers.

Conclusion

In all, the hypotheses were supported indicating strong relationship between service innovation, customer satisfaction and product performance in the telecommunication industry in Nigeria. The findings in the study show strong support for the application of, sustainable service innovation and competitive service innovation to enhance customer commitment and product performance. It is therefore imperative for telecommunication industry executives to improve performance on each construct that leads to having an improved positive end-user's experience in bridging the existing gaps of competitiveness in the industry.

Recommendations

At the end, the following recommendations are therein made:

- i. Management of the telecommunication industry should improve upon their service quality offered to their target customers. This is

- because, quality service plus customer appreciation service result to customer commitment and repeat patronage.
- ii. The telecommunication industry should imbibe the culture of building sustainable service and signal that are more reliable to meeting customer needs and demands.
 - iii. As an emerging area of interest, telecommunication operators should see the framework as an additional insight and attempt to develop retention strategies through satisfaction programs like guarantee of service, money refund offers in case of network failure as this would enhance trust and commitment and reduce switching attitude among customers in the telecommunication industry.

References

- Adamu, Garba (2021). Effect of customer relationship management on organizational performance of Airtel Nigeria in Adamawa State, Nigeria. Department of Business Administration, Nasarawa State University, Keffi, Nasarawa State, Nigeria.
- Anderson, E. W. (2000) Investigating Customer Satisfaction in the wireless Telecommunication Industry. *Journal of Telecommunication Policy*. 31(7): 93-105.
- Anyionu, Samuel Chukwu and Opara, Stella Chioma (2021). Customer Loyalty Determinants in Nigerian Telecommunication Industry. A Study of Complaint Handling. Department of Marketing, Caritas University Amorji-ike Enugu State-Nigeria and Department of Public Administration, Caritas University Amorji Nike Enugu state- Nigeria. *International Journal of Research and Innovation in Social Science*
- Berkowitz (2006). Customer Relationship Management. 8 Common goals for a CRM Program. What are Key Drivers Of Customer Satisfaction? [Online] Available at: <http://onlinesuccesscentre.com>
- Garrett, J.J. (2002). The Elements of User Experience: User-Centered Design for the Web: *Website Attributes, Customer Engagement and Retention: Empirical Evidence from Local Pakistani Companies*
- Gosney, J. W. Boehm, T. (2000). Customer Relationship Management Essentials.
- Hassenzahl, M. and Tractinsky, N. (2006). User experience – a research agenda. Darmstadt University of Technology, Department of Psychology, Social Psychology and Decision Making, Darmstadt, Germany. *Behaviour & Information Technology*, Vol. 25, No. 2, March-April 2006, 91 – 97

- Ndubisi, N.O. (2004), "Understanding the salience of cultural dimensions on relationship marketing, its underpinnings and aftermaths", *Cross Cultural Management*, Vol. 11.
- Neslin, Scott.A., Dhruv Grewal, Robert Leghorn, Venkatesh Shankar, Marije L. Teerling, Jacquelyn S. Thomas and Peter C.Verhoef (2006), "Challenges and Opportunities in Multichannel Customer Management," *Journal of Service Research*, 9 (2), 95–112.
- Petersen, J.A., Leigh, M., David, J. R., Russell, S., Kumar, V., Geoff, A. (2009). Choosing the Right Metrics to Maximize Profitability and Share holder Value.
- Pickton, D. and Broderick, A. (2005) *Integrated Marketing Communications*, Prentice Hall, Harlow.
- Swift, R.S. (2001), *Accelerating Customer Relationships: Using CRM and Relationship Technologies*, Prentice-Hall, Englewood Cliffs, NJ.